



Committee and Date

North Planning Committee

23rd July 2019

NORTH PLANNING COMMITTEE

Minutes of the meeting held on 25 June 2019

In the Shrewsbury/Oswestry Room, Shirehall, Abbey Foregate, Shrewsbury, Shropshire, SY2 6ND

2.00 - 4.05 pm

Responsible Officer: Emily Marshall

Email: emily.marshall@shropshire.gov.uk Tel: 01743 257717

Present

Councillor Paul Wynn (Chairman)

Councillors Roy Aldcroft, Gerald Dakin, Rob Gittins, Roger Hughes, Vince Hunt (Vice Chairman), Mark Jones, Paul Milner, Peggy Mullock and Joyce Barrow (Substitute) (substitute for Nicholas Bardsley)

11 Apologies for Absence

Apologies for absence were received from Councillor Nick Bardsley (substitute: Councillor Joyce Barrow) and Pauline Dee.

12 Minutes

RESOLVED:

That the Minutes of the meeting of the North Planning Committee held on 28th May 2019 be approved as a correct record and signed by the Chairman.

13 Public Question Time

There were no public questions or petitions received.

14 Disclosable Pecuniary Interests

Members were reminded that they must not participate in the discussion or voting on any matter in which they had a Disclosable Pecuniary Interest and should leave the room prior to the commencement of the debate.

With reference to planning application 18/05901/FUL, Pauls Moss Community Room, Pauls Moss, Whitchurch, Shropshire, SY13 1HH, Councillor Rob Gittins declared that he was the Deputy Portfolio Holder for Public Health, however he was considering the application with an open mind.

With reference to planning application 18/05901/FUL, Pauls Moss Community Room, Pauls Moss, Whitchurch, Shropshire, SY13 1HH, Councillor Peggy Mullock declared that as Chair of the Whitchurch Patient Group, she would speak on the application and then leave the room, taking no part in the debate or vote, due to perception of bias.

15 Pauls Moss Community Room, Pauls Moss, Whitchurch, Shropshire, SY13 1HH (18/05901/FUL)

The Planning Services Manager introduced the application for the proposed re-development, to include the demolition of Pauls Moss and associated supported living accommodation; erection of one building comprising 74 supported residential units; health centre, pharmacy, central hub space of cafe and community rooms; 85 car parking spaces, alterations to existing vehicular access, creation of two new vehicular accesses (Rosemary Lane and Dodington); landscaping scheme including removal of trees; link to adjacent public open space and confirmed that the Committee had undertaken a site visit that morning to assess the impact of the proposed development on neighbouring properties and the surrounding area. Members' attention was drawn to the information contained within the Schedule of Additional letters.

Claire Bellingham, on behalf of local residents spoke against the proposal in accordance with Shropshire Council's Scheme for Public Speaking at Planning Committees.

Antony Smith, a supporter of the scheme, spoke in support of the proposals in accordance with Shropshire Council's Scheme for Public Speaking at Planning Committees.

Councillor Bev Duffy, on behalf of Whitchurch Town Council spoke in support the proposal in accordance with Shropshire Council's Scheme for Public Speaking at Planning Committees.

In accordance with the Local Protocol for Councillors and Officers dealing with Regulatory Matters (Part 5, Paragraph 15.1) Councillor Gerald Dakin, as local ward councillor, made a statement and then left the table, took no part in the debate and did not vote on this item. During their statement, the following points were raised:

- People were living longer and so medical and social care were needed more than ever;
- Care was needed closer to home; and
- The loss of Pauls Moss House needed to be considered against the gain to the community from this once in a lifetime opportunity for Whitchurch.

In accordance with the Local Protocol for Councillors and Officers dealing with Regulatory Matters (Part 5, Paragraph 15.1) Councillor Tom Biggins, as the adjoining local ward councillor, made a statement and then left the table. During their statement, the following points were raised:

- The public health benefit had to outweigh the planning objections;

- Whitchurch was down to three GP partners and new doctors were not being recruited;
- The proposed medical facilities would attract new doctors;
- He supported the proposals, although the scheme was not perfect and additional parking was needed;
- There was no suitable alternative site; and
- The proposals would provide sustainable, long term health care and caring for the elderly and sick must outweigh the issues concerning the conservation area, the NPPF, the local plan and the loss of bricks and mortar.

Phil Brenner, Agent on behalf of the applicant spoke in support of the proposal in accordance with Shropshire Council's Scheme for Public Speaking at Planning Committees.

In accordance with her declaration at Minute 14. Councillor Peggy Mullock made a statement and then left the room during consideration of this application, taking no part in the debate.

The Planning Services Manager responded to comments made by the speakers and reminded Members of the key issues and planning considerations including that great weight must be given to preserving the character of the conservation area.

During the ensuing debate Members agreed that medical and social care facilities were very much needed within the area, however some Members considered that the merits of the proposal did not outweigh the harm arising from the loss of Pauls Moss House which would have a significant impact on the character of the conservation area. Members also expressed concerns at the scale and mass of the proposed development which was considered to be overbearing and of poor overall design. Other Members felt that notwithstanding these concerns the need for the facilities was such that they could not support the officer's recommendation.

Members considered the submitted plans and noted the comments of all speakers and on the Chairman's casting vote it was:

RESOLVED:

That planning permission be refused in accordance with the officer's recommendation, for the reasons set out below.

1. The boundary of the Whitchurch Conservation Area was drawn to incorporate the Pauls Moss mansion when designated in 1987 and this building is considered specifically to make a positive contribution to the character and appearance of the conservation area by virtue of its design, detailing, historic character and visual significance within the site. The proposed demolition of the Pauls Moss house would cause total loss of a non-designated heritage asset and substantial harm to the significance of the Conservation Area which is a designated heritage asset. Whilst the community benefits of the scheme are acknowledged insufficient justification has been provided in order to justify the substantial harm to a designated heritage asset. Therefore, the application does not comply with the National Planning Policy Framework and in particular paragraphs 192, 193, 194

and 195 and Policy CS6 of the Shropshire Core Strategy and Policies MD2 and MD13 of the SAMDev

2. The application proposes development of a scale and mass that is considered to represent over development of the site, incongruous to the built form and urban grain of the surrounding area, which will therefore have an overbearing detrimental impact on the character of the surrounding area. The design and external construction materials of the development are not considered to provide any enhancement to the surrounding Conservation Area. As such the development is considered contrary to Policies CS3 and CS6 of the Shropshire Core Strategy, Policies MD2 and MD13 of the SAMDev, the National Planning Policy Framework and Section 72(i) of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 in relation to the Conservation Area.
3. The application proposes insufficient open space and landscaping provision on a site considered overdevelopment. Further still it has not been adequately demonstrated that off-site provision and connectivity can be provided as indicated in information submitted in support of the application. The application is considered contrary to Policies CS6, CS9 and CS17 of the Shropshire Core Strategy, Policies MD2, MD8, MD12 and S18 of the SAMDev and the National Planning Policy Framework.
4. The application does not provide adequate mitigation/compensation for loss of trees on site, many of which are considered worthy of retention and contribute positively to the character of the location and the Conservation Area. The application is considered contrary to Policies CS6 and CS17 of the Shropshire Core Strategy, Policies MD2 and MD12 of the SAMDev and the National Planning Policy Framework on this matter.

16 **The Bungalow, Golf House Lane, Prees Heath, SY13 3JR (19/00744/FUL)**

The Principal Planning Officer introduced the application for the erection of two dwellings, formation of new vehicular access and confirmed that the Committee had undertaken a site visit that morning to assess the impact of the proposed development on neighbouring properties and the surrounding area.

In accordance with the Local Protocol for Councillors and Officers dealing with Regulatory Matters (Part 5, Paragraph 15.1) Councillor Gerald Dakin, as local ward councillor, made a brief statement and then left the room, took no part in the debate and did not vote on this item.

Having considered the submitted plans and listened to the comments made by all of the speakers, Members unanimously expressed their support for the proposals.

RESOLVED:

That planning permission be granted, subject to the conditions as set out in Appendix 1 of the report.

17 The Stables, Booley Road, Stanton Upon Hine Heath, SY4 4LP (18/05167/FUL)

The application was withdrawn by the applicant before consideration by Committee.

18 Appeals and Appeal Decisions

RESOLVED:

That the appeals and appeal decisions for the northern area be noted.

19 Date of the Next Meeting

It was noted that the next meeting of the North Planning Committee would be held at 2.00 p.m. on Tuesday 23rd July 2019 in the Shrewsbury/Oswestry Room, Shirehall, Shrewsbury.

Signed (Chairman)

Date: